



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

**HelpAge
International**

age helps

Strengthening state-citizen relations in fragile contexts: the role of cash transfers

By

Wale Osofisan

HelpAge International



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

**HelpAge
International**

age helps

Overview

- Cash transfers and state-citizen relations
- Case studies
- Conclusions



CTs and states-citizens relations

- Current development debate on cash transfers focuses predominantly on poverty reduction
- Objectives of CT: beyond vulnerability, risk and poverty reduction
- Instrument to address a central underlying feature of fragility – ***the absence of a functioning state-citizen relationship***
- Should provide vulnerable groups opportunities to exercise their rights as citizens
- State legitimacy and popular support
- CTs have the potential to strengthen state-citizen relations and by extension the legitimacy of the state



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

HelpAge
International

age helps

Case Studies

Research question: To what extent do cash transfer programmes strengthen state-citizen relations?

- 3 case studies were selected to reflect different types of fragility
- **SSN Sierra Leone** - a government funded and implemented programme in a *post-conflict situation*
- **HSNP Northern Kenya** – a donor funded and NGO implemented programme in a *fragile and food-insecure environment*
- ***West Darfur, Sudan** - *a conflict affected area* with no cash programme



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

HelpAge
International

age helps

Methodology

Primarily qualitative using desk study literature reviews and documentary analysis to complement data gathered through

- Semi-structured interviews with local officials including local chiefs
- Focus group discussions in 4 districts in Sierra Leone; 3 districts in Northern Kenya and 4 IDP camps in west Darfur
- Finally, a 2-day strategic research validation workshop was organised in Nairobi with key policy makers from Sierra Leone, Sudan and Kenya



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

Sierra Leone's poverty targeted SSN programme

HelpAge
International

age helps

- General consensus among beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries showed actual selection process was very unfair:

"The chiefs were responsible because they influenced the people that came from Freetown in order to favour some people who are related to them or people they like but they are still our brothers and sisters. I hope next time I will be lucky to receive the money. I will keep praying." an older woman in Borgo, Bumpe Ngao Chiefdom

"As the head of the Chiefdom the people always blame us (the paramount chief and the section chiefs) irrespective of what we do in such circumstances, those that didn't receive the money hold us responsible for their exclusion. It will make life much easier for us if everyone benefits from the programme" *Paramount Chief Bumpe Ngao*



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

**HelpAge
International**

age helps

- Programme credibility and power relations
- Manipulation of selection criteria
- Programme undermined the relationship between the local chiefs and the people
- Programme was unable to have a positive impact on state-citizen relations



Sierra Leone

Limitations and challenges

- Lack of reliable data
- Leakages and abuse
- Weak institutional capacity
- Poor infrastructure
- No linkage to any other government services



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

HelpAge
International

age helps

Findings

Northern Kenya

- Incentive for national ID cards
- **Key implication** - older people with national ID cards can now participate in the electoral process. In Kenya, one must have an ID card in order to vote.
- Role of social protection rights component (Grievance mechanism)



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

HelpAge
International

age helps

Northern Kenya 2

“At first people feared to ask things from the government, but since when we received the ‘rights education’ the community is now asking for a number of things. We always ask in a respectful way and not in a rude way. Even the chiefs are now fearful because we are asking questions without fear. We need more training so that we can continue to demand and monitor what our leaders are doing with our resources” David Edoket (57 years old) Chair RC Nawoitorong sub-location Turkana central



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

HelpAge
International

age helps

Northern Kenya (limitations and challenges)

- Donor-funded and NGO-implemented programme with limited involvement of state institutions.
- Limits its ability to contribute to enhancing state-citizen relations on a sustainable basis.
- Active government participation in Phase II?



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

HelpAge
International

age helps

Sudan

- Sudan does not currently have a cash transfer programme targeting older people
- Normative but cautious case for cash transfers instrument for strengthening state citizen



Financed by

Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

**HelpAge
International**

age helps

Conclusions

Emerging issues and implications for state-citizen relations

- The nature of programme design
- The nature of programme ownership



Further research

- Developing civil registration and record-keeping systems
- Mobilising domestic revenue
- Learning key lessons and experience from other fragile states (for example, Nepal, Kosovo and Timor-Leste)



Financed by
Federal Ministry
for Economic Cooperation
and Development

**HelpAge
International**

age helps

Thank You